

**And remind (others), for the reminder most certainly benefits the Believers
Surah Zhūriyaat, verse 55**

The Fallacy of Observing Eidul Adh-Haa with Makka

QUESTION:

A man who is a medical professional gave the Juma talk, and mentioned that Eidul-Adh-haa is the day after the Hujjaaj make wuqoof in Arafat. Therefore, he says, those who fast on Wednesday (27 May 2026) here in South Africa (which is 9th Zhul-Hijjah here in SA) will actually be fasting on Eid day, and this is haraam. He was very forceful in his viewpoint that Eidul Adh-haa must be observed with Makka Mukarramah, and that it is haraam to fast on the day of Eid. He said we should all unite on this issue and not cause disunity. Please advise if what this man said is correct.

ANSWER

First and foremost, this man should not be giving talks on Deen and should not be leading people in Salaah. He is unfit for such a post. While he may be a respected or reputable medical professional, he possesses no knowledge of Deen, as is clear from the view that he expressed in the Juma talk. This brother should stick to his medical work and not dabble in Shar'ee matters. What he uttered was out of sheer ignorance. This is the result of putting incompetent people into positions of Deen.

As regards the fallacy of celebrating Eid with Makkah, this concept has been refuted years ago by many Ulema locally and abroad. In fact, even the grand mufti of Saudi Arabia has refuted this concept and had encouraged Muslims in other countries to follow their own sighting of the crescent of Zhul-Hijjah. We challenge the proponents of this ideology to present just one hadeeth, even a *dha'eef* narration, to prove that Eidul Adh-haa in other countries must be observed the day after Arafah in Makka Mukarramah.

Actually, the whole concept of *Eid with Makka* is based on one premise, a premise that these people have conjured up themselves, and that is, *that Eidul-Adh-Haa in other parts of the world must be observed the day after the Hujjaj have performed the wuqoof in Arafah*. We emphatically reject this and state that there is no basis for this in Shariah. If there was a basis for this, then we would have found some mention of it in the books of Fiqh by the great Imams of the past. But there is absolutely nothing of this sort in Shariah.

For 8 years Rasoolullah ﷺ observed Eidul Adh-haa in Madina Munowwara, and offered Qurbani there as well, during which time Hajj was not yet made compulsory on the Ummah; is there any evidence that he announced Eid to be the Day after Arafah? To do so, he had to obtain news of

the start of Zhul-Hijjah from Makka Mukarramah. Is there any proof that he did so, even from a weak hadeeth or historical work? How, then, did he observe his Eid? The answer is found in the following hadeeth narrated by Imam Amed bin Hambal in his famous *Musnad*:

“Fast upon its sighting and make Eidul-Fitr on its sighting, and perform your *nusuk* on its sighting.” The word *nusuk* here means other acts of worship besides fasting and Eid, such as Hajj, Qurbani, and *Eidul Adh-haa*. This hadith therefore commands that, among others, Qurbani and Eidul-Adh-haa, two injunctions that are related to each other, should be observed upon the sighting of the moon. Hence, just as the majority of Muslims obey this hadeeth and look for the Ramadaan and Eid crescents in their respective countries, in like manner they are required to obey this hadeeth in relation to Eidul Adh-haa and Udh-hiyya (Qurbani). This hadith thus provides a basis for the Eidul-Fitr and Eidul Adh-haa moon sighting for Muslims in their respective countries.

If anyone claims that the rule of Eid with Makka was implemented after Hajj became faradh, which was in the 9th year of Hijrah, then such a person has to produce evidence from the hadeeth. When and how did Rasoolullah announce or promulgate this so-called rule?

There is not a shred of evidence in the entire corpus of Hadeeth and Fiqh to support this concocted and erroneous view that Eidul Adh-Haa must be celebrated with Makka Mukarramah. The rituals of Eidul Adh-haa have never been tied to the rituals of Hajj.

UNITY

When the majority of Muslims in South Africa have been, for decades, observing Eid according to the local crescent sighting, those who now break away are guilty of disuniting. They are the ones who should fall in line and unite with the rest of the Ummat here in South Africa. It is ludicrous to ask for the majority to unite with a minority, especially when the minority is totally in the wrong. Such an expectation is Shaytani manipulation.

In conclusion, Muslims in South Africa and other countries **can and must** observe *Eidul Adh-Haa* according to the local crescent sightings, and should fast on the ninth of Zhul-Hijjah, which is the day preceding Eidul Adh-Haa. They can feel content that they are acting in full accordance with Shariah. As for those who believe Eid should be observed with Makka, they are misguided, and should they offer Qurbani on that day, it will not be valid. Observing Eid with Makka is not permissible and is a *Bid'ah*.

And Allah Ta'ala knows best for His Knowledge is Absolute and Infinite.

-
- ***To receive a detailed booklet on this topic, send a mail to the email address that appears at the top of this leaflet***